

PUBLICATIONS OF MISATTRIBUTED MOZART CHORAL WORKS

— LET THE BUYER BEWARE —

by David Schildkret

AT HIS DEATH IN 1791, Mozart left a legacy of over 600 works, a body of music which has generally been the object of uninterrupted popularity and scrutiny. It is perhaps not surprising, therefore, that the public has been willing to accept (and publishers have been willing to publish) works that are of dubious authenticity. Over the two centuries since Mozart's death, many of these spurious works have been ferreted out, and information about them has become known to researchers. However, performers, often less aware, have often continued to believe in Mozart's authorship. Publishers have either been ignorant of the problem or have wished to capitalize on Mozart's name regardless of authenticity. A cursory glance at *Choral Music in Print*¹ shows that a large number of pieces, long known to be by composers other than Mozart, are still published as authentic Mozart works. Conductors need to be aware of this problem and remain abreast of the most current scholarship so that they can make intelligent choices in programming.

Schildkret is Coordinator of Choral Activities at the University of Rochester in Rochester, New York, and Music Director of the Finger Lakes Symphony Orchestra in Geneva, New York.

There are, in general, three situations causing misattribution of Mozart's music. First, there is a body of music by other composers which Mozart copied, usually for the purpose of study.² As a means of learning a particular style or technique, it was a common practice to copy the work of an admired composer. Also, hand-copying was

as the work of Karl Georg Reutter.³ In this case, an autographed manuscript by Mozart led to the original, erroneous conclusion that he had written the piece.

The second reason for misattribution is more complex. A work was published either during Mozart's lifetime or shortly after with his name on the title page. In some cases, the owner of the manuscript put Mozart's name to it in the belief that it was indeed his work. Köchel himself made such mistakes, as did the editors of the original edition of Mozart's complete works. All too often they mistook someone else's handwriting for Mozart's, and came to a false conclusion about the composition of the work.

The third, and distinctly rare reason for misattribution is fraud. The so-called *Twelfth Mass* is a famous example. First published by Simrock, and later by Novello, it came from a manuscript owned by one Carl Zulehner, a music lover who lived in Mainz. When in 1826 the authenticity of the work was called into question on stylistic grounds, Zulehner was challenged to come forward with the autograph, but failed to do so. It has long been believed that the Mass is in fact the work of Zulehner himself. Yet publishers continue to offer both the complete Mass and sections of it (e.g. the Gloria from the *Twelfth Mass*) as Mozart's composition.

Gloria in Excelsis

The image shows a page of musical notation for a Gloria in Excelsis. It features two systems of music. The first system includes vocal parts (Soprano, Alto, Tenor, Bass) and a piano accompaniment. The vocal parts have lyrics: 'Glo ri a in ex cel sis De o'. The piano part is in the right hand, and there is a bass line in the left hand. The second system continues the vocal parts and piano accompaniment. The notation is in a standard musical format with a treble clef and a common time signature.

often the only means of obtaining a score. Mozart copied a number of works by others including, for example, a setting of *De profundis* which Köchel included in his catalog as K. 93, but which Karl Pfannhauser first identified in 1953

In many cases, misattributed works are interesting and worthy of performance. Where a composer is known, he — not Mozart — should naturally receive credit, though a concert program could mention that the work was formerly attributed to Mozart. Many other works, however, only derive their interest from the possibility that they are youthful works by Mozart. The works are not terribly interesting musically, and without Mozart's name attached to them, they would justly disappear from the repertoire.

This may explain why publishers continue to print these pieces as Mozart compositions: without the name of Mozart, they would no longer be commercially viable. Part of this is our attraction to a familiar name. If a worthwhile piece turns out to be by Eberlin or Gasparini, should we not perform it? Yet publishers know they will sell many more copies of a piece by Mozart than they will one by Eberlin or

Gasparini. By the same token, we accept many inferior compositions — works by second-rate composers or shameless adaptations — simply because they bear the name of a famous composer — like a Good Housekeeping Seal of Approval. So, we must, as conductors, hold ourselves partly to blame for the alarming number of false Mozart works available on the market. If we make informed choices, selecting music not by a title and composer, but by listening to the piece or playing it at the piano, and if we stay abreast of scholarship to the extent we can, we are less likely to be victimized by errors in the publishers' catalogs.

Sometimes, however, the adapter may have gone farther afield. For instance, a piece for SAB chorus with the title "Now Sing Before the Lord" turns out to be a canon on a decidedly secular text, "Bei der Hitz im Sommer ess ich," K. 234. Mozart's secular pieces, on the other hand, are limited to choruses from operas, many canons (whose texts are often too lascivious or scatological for our tastes), and several vocal chamber ensembles — pieces for two or three voices (not chorus) and small instrumental ensembles or keyboard. Even though this repertoire is fairly limited, the listing in *Secular Choral Music in Print* takes up four pages. Most of these pages represent adaptations and rearrangements, many of them from solo songs — which may be acceptable provided one is aware that the voicings of an adaptation or arrangement may not be that of the original.

A cursory glance at Choral Music in Print shows that a large number of pieces long known to be by composers other than Mozart are still published as authentic Mozart works.

In addition to knowing the types of pieces Mozart wrote for chorus, it is helpful to know his usual voicings. Mozart wrote virtually no a cappella choral music (again, K. 20 is the exception). His sacred pieces consistently call for mixed chorus, SATB (occasionally double chorus). The secular music is for more varied combinations. There is some flexibility in many of the canons, for instance, so these are published for a variety of voicings. The most common combination of voices in the chamber ensembles is SSB, although there are several STB works, a few duets (SS, ST, SB, and TT), and one trio for TBB. The only secular SATB work, *Viviano felice*, K. 615, is lost. Mozart did write two secular works for men's chorus, the Masonic cantatas, K. 471 and K. 623. Voicings such as SSA, TTB, and SAB should therefore arouse our suspicions, as should a secular work for SATB. Most commonly these are arrangements or adaptations; occasionally, as in the case of the trio *Liebes Mädchen, hör mir zu*, they are misattributed works.

How can a conductor identify a doubtful or spurious Mozart work? With the music in hand and with access to a good library, it is not terribly difficult. It is more difficult if one knows only the publisher's name for the piece (what, for example, would the "Christmas Lullaby" be?), but it is still possible to make an educated guess.

It is helpful, first, to be aware of the character of Mozart's choral output. He wrote numerous sacred choral works, including Mass settings and several motets. The texts are all in Latin, with the exception of the early motet "God is our refuge," K. 20. An English title, then, suggests that the text has been translated or adapted. A conductor may wish to make some effort to track down the original. In many cases, the English text will be an approximation of the original Latin.

The best tools for learning the current thinking on the authenticity of any Mozart work are the Köchel catalog (which will require a little facility with German) and the works

Madrigal Dinner Scripts

by Paul Brandvik
author of

The Compleet Madrigal Dinner Booke

Scripts include:

ALL DIALOGUE:
Greetings, Toasts, Festivities,
Concert, Farewell

Plus:

HUMOROUS RENAISSANCE SKIT

Plus:

REPERTOIRE SUGGESTIONS:
Ceremonial music and concert

TWELVE different scripts available,
each an unique Renaissance delight
for your performers and your audience!

NEW this year:

NOAH AND JOAN OF ARK

Call or write for your FREE descriptive brochure. Join the hundreds who have made these Madrigal Dinners a tradition.



knight-shtick
press

Box 814 Dept. A
Bemidji, MN 56601-0814
Telephone 218-751-2148

A Division of EXTREMELY, LTD.

list given in the article on Mozart in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. The process is simplest if the publisher has supplied a Köchel number: one simply looks up the work by number in the sixth or seventh edition (they are identical) of the Köchel catalog. If the work was once included in the main body of the catalog, but is now deemed misattributed, there will be a cross reference to the appropriate appendix (Anhang). There will be given a full discussion of the work, the debate concerning its

.....

We accept many inferior compositions — works by second-rate composers or shameless adaptations — simply because they bear the name of a famous composer — like a Good Housekeeping Seal of Approval.

.....

authenticity, and the current conclusion. If the work is listed in the main part of Köchel, it was believed to be authentic in 1964 when the latest catalog was prepared. There have been a few changes since then, due to more recent studies in handwriting by Wolfgang Plath, and studies in paper types by Alan Tyson. This information is included in the works list in the *Grove Dictionary*, which is even further updated in the separately-published Mozart volume.⁴ It is, therefore, worthwhile to double check the work against this works list. All too often the publisher fails to indicate the Köchel number. In this case the title and first line index in the Köchel catalog will prove a useful starting place.

Finding the original of an adaptation will prove more difficult, since the publisher often does not give the necessary information. However, with music in hand, comparing its opening with the

incipits given in the first section of the Köchel catalog will establish the work's provenance. Lacking the music, it will be virtually impossible to track down an adaptation from the title alone. It would be safer to choose a Mozart piece by first finding something appropriate in the *Grove's* works list, and then locating a published edition. This is more reliable than working from printed editions, for even the old Mozart edition contains many works since proven to be spurious.

The following annotated list is derived from *Choral Music in Print* (CMP). It identifies works falsely attributed to Mozart which are available as Mozart compositions. Where there is more than one publisher selling the work, I have indicated the number of editions listed in CMP. I have included only those works which I could positively identify from the listing. CMP includes many works with English titles, but no Köchel number, as well

as works with unorthodox voicings, such as SAB, which may well be arrangements of authentic Mozart compositions. The conductor must decide whether these arrangements are appropriate; in performance it should be made clear to the listener that the edition is an arrangement.

Sacred works

Adoramus Te, or Adoramus Te, Christe, K. 327

A motet by Quirino Gasparini. CMP lists seven different editions. The authenticity of the work was first questioned in 1922; the misattribution was verified in 1931 when the true author was identified.

Agnus Dei from Mass in G

This is the Agnus from the notorious Twelfth Mass. CMP lists five editions.

Caecilien-Ode, K. 592

This is Mozart's orchestration of Handel's *Ode for St. Cecilia's*

The Treble Chorus of New England Choral Series

(Phase One)

Marie Stultz, Editor

Sacred Music

Lo, How a Rose E'er Blooming	SA Voices	Praetorius/Arr. Stultz	MSM-50-9901
Savior Teach Me Day By Day	Canon/2-4	Southern Harmony	MSM-50-9900

Secular Music

Child's Play	SA Voices	Louis Calabro	MSM-50-9902
This Love Is But a Wanton Fit	SSA Voices	Thomas Morley	MSM-50-9903
Welcome, Welcome, Every Guest	Canon/2-4	Southern Harmony	MSM-50-9900

MorningStar proudly announces this new series of treble chorus music, edited by Marie Stultz, a highly recognized and respected music educator, conductor, and composer in the New England region, as well as founder and Artistic Director of the Treble Chorus of New England.

A major goal of this series is to provide a source of choral music of the highest quality for children presented in practical teaching/educational editions. To that end, each publication in this series is carefully chosen from an artistic and musical standpoint. In addition, they all include a Teaching Plan, Performance Suggestions, and Historical Sources (text, music, form).

ADDITIONAL RESOURCE FROM MARIE STULTZ

Sacred Music for the Treble Voice MSM-90-3 \$4.00

A compiled and recommended list of sacred repertoire including a Difficulty Code to assist choral conductors in considering anthems for their choir. List reflects music that builds beautiful choral singing and natural tone in children and assists in healthy vocal growth. Valuable resource to develop a fine children's choral library.

MorningStar
MUSIC PUBLISHERS

SPECIAL INTRODUCTORY OFFER

- All 4 anthems (\$4.05 retail value) Order No. CJ-1-99 \$3.00
- All 4 anthems plus Sacred Music for the Treble Voice (\$8.05 retail value) Order No. CJ-1-993 \$6.00

3303 Meramec, Suites 205-207 . St. Louis MO 63118-4310 . (314) 352-3303

Day, but it is not identified as such in CMP.

Convertentur Sedentes, K. 177

Köchel thought Mozart had written this piece for Munich, but a score was later found in Salzburg with the more credible attribution to Leopold Mozart.

De Profundis, K. 93

A Psalm setting by Karl Georg Reutter which Mozart copied.

The manuscript contains parts for two violins by Mozart. CMP lists 11 editions.

Gloria (from Twelfth Mass)

See above. CMP lists 25 editions.

Iustum deduxit Dominus, K. 326

A piece by the Salzburg Kapellmeister, Ernst Eberlin, which Mozart presumably copied

as a study piece. Plath thinks that the handwriting in the copy is not Mozart's at all, but Leopold's, which means the attribution is doubly wrong. CMP lists four editions.

Mass in G, K. 232

A misprint, either by the publisher or by CMP; it should be K. A. 232, which is again the fraudulent Twelfth Mass.

Mass in C, K. 115

This incomplete *Missa brevis*, with only the first nine bars of a Sanctus and no Agnus Dei, was still included in the Köchel catalog in 1964. Plath, on the basis of the handwriting, attributes it to Leopold Mozart along with K. 116, a *Missa brevis* in F Major. CMP lists three editions.

O Salutaris Hostia

This work, offered by two different publishers, does not appear in either Köchel or *Grove*. There is no evidence of any setting by Mozart of this text.

Tantum ergo, K. 142

Both this and K. 197, another *Tantum ergo*, are by Aloys Fuchs. CMP lists three editions of each.

Wiengeliend, K. 350

Originally a song for solo voice on a text by Friedrich Wilhelm Gotter, the music is by Bernhard Flies. This is widely published under many titles: "Christmas Lullaby," "Cradle Song" (5 in CMP), "Schlafe, mein Prinzchen, schlaf ein" (the opening words of the text — 8 in CMP), "Sleep, My Princess" (a mistranslation of the German: sleep, my little prince), and "Slumber Song." It is a lullaby to the Infant Jesus, and is therefore listed both as a sacred and secular piece in CMP. Under the title "Wiegenlied" CMP lists 12 editions. Publishers are not alone in perpetuating this mistake; a toy company markets a music box which plays "Mozart's Lullaby" — the same work.

Secular works

Mozart wrote less secular choral music than sacred, as noted above. CMP lists many arrangements of solo songs for chorus; these should be used cautiously. Such items as "Calypso Canon" (published by Staff Music Publishing, Inc.) are clearly based only loosely on Mozart's music. Nevertheless, two identifiably spurious works are listed in *Secular Choral Music in Print*.

D'Baurin hat d'Katz verlorn

Although Mozart based the finale of his *Divertimento in B-flat major*, K. 287, on this melody, the song is not originally by Mozart. Köchel himself listed the work among the doubtful and spurious works in the first version of his catalog; this conclusion was supported by E.K. Blümmel in 1923. CMP lists two editions, one under the English title, "Farmer's Wife Lost Her Cat."

Ständchen, K. 441c

One of the few inconclusive cases. This work has been included in the main body of the Köchel catalog, and such scholars as Friedländer, Paumgartner, and Moser have argued for Mozart's authorship. The consensus among scholars, however, is that it is not an authentic Mozart work. If one wishes to perform it as a Mozart composition, a case in favor of the attribution should be made in the program notes. CMP lists four editions.



Notes

¹ Gary S. Eslinger and F. Mark Dougherty, *Sacred Choral Music in Print*, Philadelphia, 1985. F. Mark Dougherty and Susan H. Simon, *Secular Choral Music in Print*, Philadelphia, 1987.

² The seventh edition of the Köchel catalog lists 88 such works in a separate appendix.

³ Karl Pfannhauser, "Mozart hat copiert," in: *Acta Mozartiana* 1954 H. 2/3.

⁴ Stanley Sadie, *The New Grove Mozart*, New York, 1983.

Articles submitted for publication in the *Choral Journal* should meet established specifications. Though the length of articles varies considerably, submissions are generally to be between 10 and 20 typed, double-spaced pages. Referenced material should be indicated by superscript and end notes. All submissions need to include five copies of the article as well as accompanying artwork and a two- or three-sentence professional identification of the author. For complete writer's guidelines and/or to submit articles, write the Managing Editor, P.O. Box 6310, Lawton, Oklahoma 73506.

QUALITY
INTERNATIONAL
CONCERT TOURS
at
REASONABLE PRICES

Call or write today
for our unique
personalized service!

TOLL FREE
800-869-1406

**MARK FOSTER
MUSIC TOURS**

Box 2760
SANTA CLARA
California 95055-2760